

17.584, Civil-Military Relations, Spring 2003
Prof. Roger Petersen
Lecture 9: Turkey and Pakistan

Week 9 Reading Summaries

Rizvi, Hasan-Askari, "The Military and Politics in Pakistan," *Journal of Asian and African Studies* 26 (1991): 27-42.

Transition from Zie's regime to Benazir Bhutto. Brief history of Pakistan civil-military 1948 Jinnah dies, 1958 first coup Ayub Khan, 1969 Yahya Khan takes charge, 1971 defeat by India in East Pakistan, Yahya Khan hands over to Zulfikar Ali Bhutto, 1977 Zie removes Bhutto, 1988 Zie dies, military hands it over to civilians, B. Bhutto PPP (Pakistan People's Party) IDA Islamic MQM of Urdu-speaking muhajir..

Provincial conflict in Sind (Sindhians, Punjabis and Pakhtuns, MQM). Less in Bolukistan ('73-'77). Bhutto careful to mend fences with military in the first years but author claimed military will return if civil parties competition disintegrates to unrest.

Heper, Metin, and Aylin Guney, "The Military and Democracy in the Third Turkish Republic," *Armed Forces and Society* 22 (1996): 619-642.

After brief comment on 1960 colonels vs '71 and '80 generals coups, the article proceeds with eulogy on chiefs of staff: Evren ('78-'87), Torumtay ('87-'90), and Gures ('94) presenting them as respecting democracy, allowing it to function. "argued that they too derived their power directly from the people." Argues that Turkey is different from Brazil because the military is committed to Westernization and democracy.

Sakallioğlu, Umit Cizre, "The Anatomy of the Turkish Military's Political Autonomy," *Comparative Politics* (1997):151-166.

"Civilian's tenuous hegemony." Military's respect for democracy and civilian rule, he indexes power of the military through presidency, organization of defense and budget control, NSC (too wide authorities), procurement, international security and intelligence, and promotions.

Lecture

AN OUTLINE OF LATE OTTOMAN AND REPUBLICAN TURKISH HISTORY

(bold indicates key dates for civil-military relations)

- 1774 Treaty of Kucuk Kainarci ends Russo-Turkish war; Russia annexes Crimea
- 1789 French Revolution; Sultan Selim III ascends to the throne
- 1792 Treaty of Jassy with Russia; Selim III launches Nizami Cedid reforms
- 1795 Army engineering school established
- 1798 Napoleon invades Egypt

1804 Serbian Revolt

1807 Janissary revolt deposes Sultan Selim III

1821 Greek Revolution

1826 Beneficial Event: Sultan Mahmut II crushes and abolishes Janissary corps

1828/9 War with Russia; Ottoman Empire accedes to Greek independence

1832/33 and 1839-41 Wars between Ottomans and Egypt, ruled by Mehmet Ali

1839 Tanzimat reforms launched by sultan Abdulmecit

1845 Conscription introduced; Christians eventually excluded

1853-56 Crimean War

1860s *Jeune Turcs* opposition circle forms in Paris favoring a constitution

1875/6 Bosnian and Bulgarian revolts; coup in Istanbul brings Young Ottomans to office, Sultan Abdulhamid II to power, and the first constitution in force

1877/8 War with Russia, Congress of Berlin, creation of Bulgaria, recognition of Serbia's and Rumania's independence; Abdulhamid II suspends constitution

1895 Committee of Union and Progress (Ittifak ve Teraki Cemiyeti) forms in Paris

1908 CUP coup deposes Abdulhamid; first elections; Austria annexes Bosnia; Bulgaria declares independence

1911/2 War with Italy leads to loss of Libya and Dodecanese islands; Albanian revolt

1912/13 Balkan wars lead to loss of most of European Turkey

1913 Babi Ali coup brings Enver-Talat-Cemal triumvirate to power

1914 Ottoman Empire sides with the Central Powers in World War I

1915 Abortive Franco-British landing at Gallipoli

1918 Armistice of Moudros between Ottoman Empire and Entente

1919 Mustafa Kemal lands at Samsun; Defense of Rights movement

1920 Treaty of Sevres: partition of the Ottoman Empire among the Entente powers

1919-22 War of Independence

1923 Treaty of Lausanne; establishment of the Turkish Republic

1924 First constitution of the republic; Republican People's Party (RPP) and opposition Progressive People's Party (PRP) formed

1925/6 Kurdish revolt suppressed; PRP closed down

1931 One-party state officially declared

1938 Kemal Ataturk dies, succeeded by Ismet Inonu

1945 Turkey declares war on Germany

1946 Opposition Democratic Party (DP) formed; republic's first multi-party elections

1947 Truman Doctrine for Greece and Turkey

1950 DP wins landslide election

1951-53 Korean War

1952 Turkey joins NATO
1954 DP wins even more decisive election
1959 Britain, Greece, and Turkey agree to an independent Cyprus (Zurich accords); DP launches investigation committee on relations between army and RPP

1960 May 27 military coup; National Unity Committee led by General Gursel

1961 Menderes executed; second constitution; creation of senate, freedom of press and universities; Worker's Party (Turkiye Isci Partisi) founded
1962 Gursel purges right wing extremist Colonel Alpaslan Turkes
1963/4 Inter-communal violence in Cyprus; abortive Acheson Plan
1965 DP successor Justice Party (Adalet Partisi), led by Suleyman Demirel, wins election
1966 Bulent Ecevit succeeds Inonu as RPP chair and turns the party left
1969 Turkes founds Nationalist Action Party (Milli Hareket Partisi-MHP)
1970 Necmedin Erbakan founds National Order Party (Milli Nizam Partisi)
1968-1970 Street and campus violence between left and right wing groups
1971 March 12 military ultimatum; Nihat Erim government; Workers' Party and National Order Party closed down
1972 Erbakan resurfaces with National Salvation Party (Milli Selamet Partisi)
1974 Ecevit briefly in power; Turkish invasion of Cyprus after Greek junta coup
1974-77 JP-NAP-NSP coalition led by Demirel; Turkes paramilitary controls police
1978 Kurdish Worker's Party (PKK) founded by Abdullah Ocalan
1978-80 Ecevit and Demirel alternate in power as street violence between left and right wing groups escalates and political assassinations take place

1980 September 10 coup; political parties closed down

1982 Third constitution approved by referendum; General Evren becomes president
1983 Motherland Party (Anavatan Partisi-ANAP) wins election led by Turgut Ozal
1984 PKK launches resurrection campaign in Kurdish areas in the southeast
1987 Ban on politicians lifted by referendum—a defeat for Ozal
1989 Turgut Ozal elected president by parliament
1991 Gulf War; Demirel's Dogru Yol Partisi (DYP) wins election
1993 Death of President Ozal, succeeded by Suleyman Demirel
1995 Islamic Welfare Party (Refah), led by Necmedin Erbakan, comes first in election and eventually forms coalition government with DYP

1997 Velvet coup: Prime Minister Erbakan resigns under military pressure

1998 Turkey forces Syria to expel Ocalan; S-300 missile crisis in Cyprus
1999 Ecevit coalition government; Ocalan arrested while fleeing Greek embassy in Kenya; major earthquake hits Anatolia; Turkey acquires candidate status to EU
2002 Constitutional reform allows use of Kurdish in media and education; Islamic AK Party wins election; Kofi Anan proposes peace plan for Cyprus
2003 Anan Plan rejected by Turkish Cypriot leader Rauf Denktas; Iraq War

PRESIDENTS OF TURKEY (bold indicates military background)

Mustafa Kemal Atatürk (1923-1938)

İsmet İnönü (1938-1950)

Celal Bayar (1950-1960)

Cemal Gürsel (1961-1966)

Cevdet Sunay (1966-1973)

Fahri Korotürk (1973-1980)

Kenan Evren (1982-1989)

Turgut Özal (1989-1993)

Süleyman Demirel (1993-2000)

Ahmet Necdet Sezer (2000-)

1982 CONSTITUTION, ARTICLE 118 [**with 2001 amendments**]

The National Security Council shall be composed of the Prime Minister, the Chief of the General Staff, [**Deputy Prime Ministers, Ministers of Justice,**] the Ministers of National Defence, Internal Affairs, and Foreign Affairs, the Commanders of the Army, Navy and the Air Force and the General Commander of the Gendarmerie, under the chairmanship of the President of the Republic.

Depending on the particulars of the agenda, Ministers and other persons concerned may be invited to meetings of the Council and their views heard.

The National Security Council shall submit to the Council of Ministers its views on taking decisions and ensuring necessary coordination with regard to the formulation, establishment, and implementation of the national security policy of the State. The Council of Ministers shall give priority consideration to the decisions [**shall evaluate decisions**] of the National Security Council concerning the measures that it deems necessary for the preservation of the existence and independence of the State, the integrity and indivisibility of the country and the peace and security of society.

The agenda of the National Security Councils shall be drawn up by the President of the Republic taking into account the proposals of the Prime Minister and the Chief of the General Staff.

In the absence of the President of the Republic, the National Security Council shall meet under the chairmanship of the Prime Minister.

The organisation and duties of the General Secretariat of the National Security Council shall be regulated by law.

AN OUTLINE OF MODERN GREEK HISTORY

(with reference to civil-military relations)

1814 The secret Greek nationalist organization Filike Etaireia is founded in Odessa

1821 Greek Revolution against Ottoman Empire

1822 Proclamation of the first constitution

1832 Kingdom of Greece established under King Otto

1843 Army-backed revolution forces Otto to introduce a constitution

1862-3 King Otto forced to resign by popular uprising; George I becomes king

1866-9 Cretan revolt

1894 The secret nationalist organization Ethnike Etaireia is founded by army officers

1897 Cretan revolt; disastrous war against Turkey instigated by Ethnike Etaireia

1904-8 “Macedonian Struggle” between Greek and Bulgarian-backed guerrilla units in Ottoman Macedonia

1909 Goudi coup: barracks pronunciamento forces King George to reform military

and appoint the Cretan politician Eleftherios Venizelos as prime minister

1912-3 Balkan Wars; first tensions between Venizelos and Prince Constantine

1915 Abortive Entente Gallipoli operation; Venizelos resigns; Anglo-French landing at

Salonika.

1916 Salonika coup establishes pro-Entente government in Northern Greece under Venizelos

1917 King Constantine ousted; Greece officially joins the Entente in World War I

1920 Treaty of Sevres establishes “Greece of the Two Continents and Five Seas”;

Venizelos loses election and flees to France; King Constantine returns to Greece and continues war against Turkey

1922 Coup against King Constantine by retreating Greek forces on Chios island

1923 Counter-coup suppressed; treaty of Lausanne with Turkey negotiated by Venizelos

1924 Declaration of the Republic

1926 Dictatorship by General Theodoros Pangalos; he steps down after orchestrating a border war with Bulgaria

1930 Ataturk-Venizelos friendship accord

1933 Failed coup by Plastiras tries to prevent Venizelos’ defeat in the elections

1935 Failed Venizelist coup; ro-royalist counter-coup brings back King George II from exile

1936 August 4: in reaction to labor unrest, general Ioannis Metaxas establishes fascist dictatorship approved by George II

1940 Italian attack is repelled by Greek forces led by General Papagos

1941 German forces overrun Greece; government flees to Crete, then London and Cairo

1943 Leftist mutinies among Greek military personnel in the Middle East crushed with British help

1944 Axis withdrawal from Greece; return of King George II; fighting between forces of the communist resistance (EAM-ELAS) and Greek royalists and British units in Athens

1945 Right wing officers form the secret organization IDEA

1945-6 Tenuous political situation between left and right over amnesty and voter registers

1947-49 Greek Civil War

1951 General Papagos prevents coup by his supporters among IDEA officers

1952 Greece joins NATO; Papagos is appointed prime minister by King Paul

1955 Papagos dies; Constantine Caramanlis becomes prime minister; beginning of

EOKA anti-British guerrilla campaigning in Cyprus

1958 National Union of Young Officers, an offshoot of IDEA, founded by George Papadopoulos

1959 London-Zurich accords establish Cyprus as independent state

1961 Caramanlis accused of rigging elections by opposition leader George Papandreou

1963 Leftist MP Lambrakis murdered by right-wing paramilitaries; Caramanlis flees to Paris after fallout with palace; George Papandreou's centrist party wins election; inter-communal violence breaks out in Cyprus

1964 George Papandreou rejects Acheson Plan for Cyprus

1965 The ASPIDA scandal implicating Andreas Papandreou, the son of the prime minister, in plotting a leftist coup forces George Papandreou to resign

1965-7 Political instability as King Constantine II refuses to call elections

1967 April 21 Colonel coup led by George Papadopoulos forestalls elections; King Constantine launches abortive counter-coup in December and flees abroad

1973 Abortive naval mutiny; abolition of the monarchy; student uprising at Athens Polytechnic; Brigadier Dimitrios Ioannides sidesteps Papadopoulos

1974 Ioannides stages coup in Cyprus against Archbishop Makarios; Turkish invasion; junta collapses in Cyprus and Greece; Caramanlis returns; referendum for abolition of the monarchy

1981 Greece enters the EEC; Andreas Papandreou becomes the first socialist prime minister of Greece

1987 Military crisis with Turkey over the continental shelf in the Aegean Sea

1989 Papandreou-Ozal dialogue begins at Davos; Papandreou loses the election

1996 Papandreou dies and is succeeded by Costas Simitis; Imia islet crisis with Turkey

1998 S-300 missile crisis in Cyprus

1999 Ocalan affair leads to resignation of Foreign Minister Theodoros Pangalos (the younger); earthquake diplomacy by foreign minister George Papandreou, son of Andreas, signals Greek-Turkish rapprochement

2003 Anan Plan rejected; Cyprus signs accession to the EU

PRESIDENTS OF GREECE (bold indicates officer background, underlined for periods of military rule)

Pavlos Koudouriotis (1924-1926, 1926-1929)

Theodoros Pangalos (1926)

Alexandros Zaimis (1929-1935)

Georgios Papadopoulos (1973)

Phaidon Gizikis (1973-1974)

Mikhail Stasinopoulos (1974-1975)

Constantinos Tsatsos (1975-1980)

Constantinos Caramanlis (1980-1985, 1990-1995)

Christos Sartzetakis (1985-1990)

Kostis Stephanopoulos (1995-)

GENERAL HISTORICAL SCHEMA

Greece: establishment of parliamentary democracy (19th century) → [beginnings of military involvement and professionalization due to international factors (1890s-1917)] → militarized struggle between left and right (1916-1974) → stable parliamentary democracy (1974-)

Turkey: beginnings of military involvement and professionalization due to international factors (19th century) → modernizing revolution and single party rule (1908-1946) → parallel development of parties and military as a political actor (1946-)

CONTROL MECHANISMS

Turkey

Non-intervention norm (objective): not yet in place

Political indoctrination (subjective): 20s-30s, 80s; difficult in a pluralist society

Legal/constitutional: article 118

Elite cooptation: declined since 1930s, ended in 1989

Divide and conquer: the army is the dominant service

Bribe: reason for 1960 coup, OYAK

Small Military: N/A; high threat environment and low technological sophistication

Citizen Army: N/A; requires a civil society committed to democracy

Greece

Non-intervention norm: violated by politicians, strong since 1974

Political indoctrination/parallel hierarchy: N/A in too pluralist a political system

Legal/constitutional: violated by politicians and/or military, strong after 1974

Elite cooptation: briefly practiced after major wars (Kanaris, Koundouriotis, Papagos) [not exactly; see also Metaxas, Kondylis, Plastiras]

Divide and conquer: across party lines (opposite effect); navy mostly center-leftist

Bribe: across party lines (opposite effect)

Small Military: N/A; high threat environment and low technological sophistication

Citizen Army: N/A if political/social conflict is high

Note: we have not examined how the same or similar mechanisms are used by the military to control civilians

OTHER THOUGHTS

- 1) Horizontally (Turkey) vs. vertically (Greece) politicized militaries
 - a. Time dependence argument of norm development (→ fewer years of military rule in Greece due to parliamentary tradition) [actually it's 17 years for both, but less mil/total years for Greece since 1843 than for Turkey since 1908—but why start Turkey in 1908?]]

- b. Formative period argument (Greece: 19th century; modeled on Britain—Turkey: 1920s-1930s; totalitarian influence)
 - c. Hypothesis on relative synchronization of institutional development (parties developed before military professionalized in Greece)
 - i. Professionalization in developing societies: initially bad?
- 2) Pace of military withdrawal from politics: external shock (1974 for Greece)
- 3) Effect on Greek-Turkish relations? Wars vs. MIDs (all modern wars started when one of the two countries was democratic and the other authoritarian, but there were many periods of tension while both were democratic, a period of friendship in the 1930s when both were authoritarian, and the 1974 Turkish invasion continued after civilians returned to power in Greece and Cyprus)
 - a. Mansfield-Snyder argument about democratization and war [Boaz]
- 4) Role of international norms and US: interwar and Cold War vs. post-Cold War (Britain in the interwar period and the US in the Cold War tolerated or even applauded military rule when it suited their interests but the origins of the coups were more domestic than international; after the end of the Cold War, both countries belong or aspire to belong in international organizations that do not tolerate dictatorships; however, velvet coups in Turkey, as the 1997 one, remain a possibility)