

Genetically Modified Organisms (GMOs): Good, Bad, or ???

1. Why are GMOs an issue? (Commitment)

2. What are GMOs? (Definition)

- Are there multiple definitions? Why? (Do different stakeholders give different definitions?)
- Are there terms within the definition that need to be defined?
- How do we decide between the different definitions?
- What is at stake in giving a definition?

3. Who are the stakeholders in the development, consumption and critique of GMOs? (Community)

4. What is at issue between these stakeholders? What are their different claims? (Conjectures)

- Are there errors and misunderstandings that might be corrected?
- Are some stakeholders better positioned to have the relevant knowledge?

5. On what points (if any) do the stakeholders agree and disagree? (Stasis?)

- Can we use points of agreement to settle disagreements?
- Are there some disagreements that will be intractable? Why?
- Should we focus on debates between only a subset of the stakeholders? Which ones? Why?

6. How should we determine the value of GMOs? (Value)

- What values should guide our evaluation of the positions?
- Are there shared values to rely on?
- If there aren't shared values, how might we defend the values we will employ against our opponents' values?

7. What policy should be endorsed? (Policy)

- Based on our evaluation of GMOs, what policies should be put in place?
- How does individual preference based on individual values relate to public policy?

Re 2: Defining GMOs - Definitions from Wikipedia:

A **genetically modified organism (GMO)** is an **organism** whose **genetic** material has been altered using **genetic engineering** techniques.

Genetic engineering, also called **genetic modification**, is the direct manipulation of an organism's **genome** using **biotechnology**.

Biotechnology (sometimes shortened to "**biotech**") is generally accepted as the use of living systems and organisms to develop or make useful products. For thousands of years, humankind has used biotechnology in agriculture, food production and medicine.^[1] The term itself is largely believed to have been coined in 1919 by Hungarian engineer **Karl Ereky**. In the late 20th and early 21st century, biotechnology has expanded to include new and diverse sciences such as **genomics**, **recombinant genetechologies**, applied **immunology**, and development of pharmaceutical therapies and diganostic tests.^[2]

Re 4: Claims to be considered (Thompson)

- a) GMOs may not be *safe*. (210)
- b) GMOs are not adequately *tested*. (212)

- c) GMOs may be *environmentally risky*. (213)
- d) The companies and university scientists developing GMOs are not to be *trusted*. (215)
- e) GMOs are not *sustainable*. (216)
- f) Resistance to GMOs is politically important way to protest rampant capitalism, globalization, corporate greed, the decline of rural communities, etc. (216)
- g) Other??

Re 7: Policy?

- a) I should not eat GMOs.
- b) You should not eat GMOs.
- c) GMOs should be banned.
- d) GMOs should be labeled.
- e) Other??

MIT OpenCourseWare
<http://ocw.mit.edu>

24.03 Good Food: The Ethics and Politics of Food Choices
Fall 2012

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit: <http://ocw.mit.edu/terms>.